

## Driver License Office Queuing System Review Consulting Engagement 201516-18

April 29, 2016

### Executive Summary

---

In December 2015, the Office of the Inspector General initiated a consulting engagement regarding concerns with the validity of the customer wait times being reported by Department driver license offices. Division of Motorist Services' management received a complaint that members working in driver license offices were circumventing the Q-Matic wait time system by not issuing tickets to customers until they could ensure that the customers could be served in less than 30 minutes. Q-Matic is an electronic queue management and customer flow system used to make customer service delivery more effective and efficient.

The objective of this engagement was to recommend improvements to the use of Q-Matic to reduce the risk of data manipulation and increase the confidence in the validity of the statistics reported.

We interviewed management from the Division of Motorist Services' Bureau of Credentialing Services. Management was aware that Q-Matic is vulnerable to manipulation by members in various ways, including; not issuing tickets to customers upon completing check in, transferring tickets between queues, causing the wait time to restart; manipulating the system to show additional customers being served; and removing customers from the queue as if they never came into the office.

We recommend the following to the Division of Motorist Services to assist with ensuring accuracy of customer wait times:

- Management should formally evaluate the current queuing system to determine if it meets Division needs.
- Regional managers should periodically compare the number of transactions reflected in FDLIS to the number of customers served reflected in Q-Matic to determine an acceptable difference rate and identify potential manipulation of Q-Matic.
- Management should clarify with office managers the intent of the SMART expectation that incorporates customer wait time.

## Background and Introduction

---

In December 2015, the Office of the Inspector General initiated a consulting engagement regarding concerns with the validity of the customer wait times being reported by Department driver license offices. Division of Motorist Services management received a complaint that members working in driver license offices were circumventing Q-Matic by not issuing tickets to customers until they could ensure that the customers could be served in less than 30 minutes.

The objective of this engagement was to recommend improvements to the use of Q-Matic to reduce the risk of data manipulation and increase the confidence in the validity of the statistics reported.

### Q-Matic

Q-Matic is an electronic queue management and customer flow system used to make customer service delivery more effective and efficient.

Prior to the installation of Q-Matic, customers visiting driver license and motor vehicle offices were greeted by a receptionist who assigned the customer a paper number and placed them on a manual waiting list. It was the responsibility of the receptionist to monitor the examiners' station to determine when to send the next customer to the counter. This process was highly dependent on the experience and judgment of the receptionist and provided no basis for matching customer needs with the examiners' skill level or job assignment. Customer flow was often inefficient, resulting in longer transaction times and wait times. This process also did not provide management reports or statistics for performance measures.

In 2008, the Department solicited proposals to acquire a customer queuing system through an Invitation to Negotiate. The Department received legislative funding to purchase Q-Matic to improve customer service in all state-operated driver license and motor vehicle offices. Q-Matic was installed in 54 state issuance offices in early 2009. After driver license issuance services transitioned to local tax collector offices in most Florida counties, Q-Matic only remains in 16 driver license offices in three counties: Broward, Miami-Dade, and Volusia.

The Department purchased two functions within Q-Matic: the Management Portal and the Suite.

The Management Portal produces reports to determine office productivity and to identify areas that may need improvement. Management has the ability to assign examiners to specific duties and adjust those duties based on customer needs. The Management Portal also generates reports which show wait times, transaction times, individual

performance, and trends for each service type. Decisions concerning staffing can also be made based on the data from the system.

The Suite manages and tracks customer flow and overall wait time. Using this application, managers can study individual aspects of an area of customer activities and receive reports on service levels per office, region, or in total. Q-Matic software is capable of calculating, compiling, and displaying statistical data that allow for several types of reports to be generated for comprehensive analysis of historical data.

## Customer Wait Time and Office Flow

Customers visiting state-operated driver license offices in Broward, Miami-Dade and Volusia counties with Q-Matic begin their office visit by checking in at the information desk. Members at the information desk greet the customer, review the reason for the customer's visit, and ensure the customer has all the necessary documentation with them to complete their desired transaction. A Q-Matic ticket with a printed service number (ticket) is then issued to the customer and their wait for service begins. In some instances, a customer may have to wait in line prior to reaching the information desk. This wait time is not captured. At some locations, if the office is busy, pagers (similar to those used in restaurants) are issued to customers to alert them when to return to the information desk to receive a ticket.

Each ticket is tied to the customer's specific need and determines the appropriate queue and examiner to process the customer's transaction. The following list includes the classification of queues used:

- A – for customers with an appointment
- B – for walk-in customers
- G – for customers only taking an exam, who have an appointment
- H – for walk in customers only taking an exam
- I – for customers who need information only (for example: ask a question, no transaction processed)
- M – for customers who go directly to the counter for service i.e. “walk direct” (usually happens when the office first opens and no one is waiting in line yet)

After a customer has checked in and received a number, wait time begins. Q-Matic provides audio-visual means for directing customers to the appropriate counter. The queuing system uses a wall mounted flat screen TV monitor to display the ticket number and the appropriate examiner station number. When the customer is called, the examiner will indicate that they are serving the customer within Q-Matic. Once the transaction begins, the wait time ends. When the transaction is complete, the examiner alerts Q-Matic to call for the next customer.

## Customer Wait Time Performance Measure

The Government Accountability and Performance Act of 1994 requires state agencies to implement performance-based program budgeting, which includes establishing legislatively approved performance measures and standards.

The Division of Motorist Services office wait time performance measure standard is to serve 95% of customers at state operated offices in Broward, Miami-Dade, and Volusia counties within 30 minutes or less. Q-Matic is used to calculate this measure. The elapsed time is calculated from the time the customer is issued a ticket to the time the transaction is initiated. This performance measure is incorporated into driver license office managers' performance expectations. Actions taken by managers to address wait time issues within their offices are the basis for their evaluation. When grading wait time and customer service, Division management looks for efforts made by managers to maintain a high level of operational efficiency, which should result in achieving the best possible wait time.

The following chart details the wait time statistics for the month of February 2016 for all 16 offices which use Q-Matic:

February 2016 Wait Time Report	
Total customers served in less than 30 minutes	128,176
Total customers served in more than 30 minutes	18,585
Office monthly total customers	146,761
<b>Average served in 30 minutes or less</b>	<b>87.3%</b>

## Results of Review

We interviewed management from the Division of Motorist Services' Bureau of Credentialing Services. Because customer wait time is an element of office managers' performance expectations, there is a level of concern that the numbers may be manipulated. Management was aware that Q-Matic is vulnerable to manipulation by members or managers in various ways, including the following:

- Customers may not be issued a Q-Matic ticket immediately after completing the check in process.
- Tickets can be transferred from one queue to another, or within the same queue, at any time and by any person who has access to Q-Matic. When a ticket is transferred, the wait time restarts and no record of the previous wait time is

collected. Also, Q-Matic does not allow for reports of any kind regarding transferred tickets.

- Although the same ticket number is used when a ticket is transferred, the system shows that an additional customer has been served.
- Tickets can be removed from Q-Matic any time prior to the ticket number being called. If a ticket is removed, the wait time is not collected. Also, Q-Matic does not allow for reports of any kind regarding deleted tickets.

Additionally, some offices which frequently have a line of customers waiting to get into the door will assign customers a time to return to the office later in the day. These customers are treated similarly to customers who make an appointment in advance, and are entered into a specific queue. This allows the office to better meet the needs of the customer, and manage long wait lines within driver license offices.

We also reviewed the total transactions initiated in FDLIS and compared to the number of tickets issued through Q-Matic for the month of February, 2016. Transactions in FDLIS many not always be completed due to the customer not having all required documentation, not having payment, or other reasons. The chart below shows the difference in the total transactions started in FDLIS and the number of tickets issued through Q-Matic:

FDLIS Compared to Q-MATIC for February, 2016	
Q-Matic Tickets Issued	146,761
Total Transactions Initiated in FDLIS	158,933
Total Transactions Completed in FDLIS	139,054
<b>Difference in transactions started and Q-Matic tickets issued</b>	<b>12,172</b>

## Conclusions

The Department uses Q-Matic to provide data that aids management in decision making. This data is also reported to the Governor and Cabinet by the Department Executive Director. The purpose of reporting the percent of customers served within 30 minutes is to monitor whether customers are being served timely and to indicate efficiency of office operations.

If driver license office staff are manipulating customer tickets in Q-Matic through transferring tickets in and out of a queue, removing tickets, and resetting customer wait time, the data from Q-Matic cannot be relied upon to report a valid wait time statistic.

We recommend the following to the Division of Motorist Services to assist with ensuring accuracy of customer wait times:

- Management should formally evaluate the queuing system to determine if it meets Division needs.
- Regional managers should periodically compare the number of transactions reflected in FDLIS to the number of customers served reflected in Q-Matic to determine an acceptable difference rate and identify potential manipulation of Q-Matic.
- Management should clarify with office managers the intent of the SMART expectation that incorporates customer wait time.

## **Purpose, Scope, and Methodology**

---

The purpose of this review was to recommend improvements to the use of Q-Matic to reduce the risk of data manipulation and increase the confidence in the validity of the statistics reported.

The scope of this review included all aspects of driver license office operations, specifically the queue management system.

The methodology included:

- Reviewing applicable Florida Statutes and Florida Administrative Code;
- Reviewing applicable Department policy and procedures;
- Reviewing industry standards;
- Reviewing driver license office operations;
- Observing the Q-Matic system; and
- Interviewing appropriate Department members.



## **Distribution, Statement of Accordance, and Project Team**

---

### **Distribution**

Terry L. Rhodes, Executive Director  
Diana Vaughn, Deputy Executive Director  
Robert Kynoch, Director of Motorist Services  
Deborah Roby, Deputy Director of Motorist Services, Customer Service Delivery  
Oscar Tolmos, Bureau of Credentialing Services

### **Statement of Accordance**

Section 20.055, Florida Statutes, requires the Florida Department of Highway Safety and Motor Vehicles' Inspector General to review, evaluate, and report on policies, plans, procedures, accounting, financial, and other operations of the Department and to recommend improvements. This consulting engagement was conducted in accordance with applicable *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing* published by the Institute of Internal Auditors and *Principles and Standards for Offices of Inspector General* published by the Association of Inspectors General.

### **Project Team**

Engagement conducted by:  
Erin Mook, Auditor  
Vanessa Williams, Auditor

Under the supervision of:  
David Ulewicz, Audit Director

Approved by:

  
Julie M. Leftheris, Inspector General